

347 Madison Avenue  
New York, NY 10017-3739  
212 878-7200 Tel  
212 878-7030 Fax

Thomas F. Prendergast  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer



## Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

August 30, 2013

Ms. Carmen Maldonado  
Audit Director  
The Office of the State Comptroller  
Division of State Government Accountability  
123 William Street - 21<sup>st</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10038

**Re: Final Report #2013-F-8 (Follow-Up to Selected Aspects of Bus Fleet Maintenance)**

Dear Ms. Maldonado:

This is in reply to your letter requesting a response to the above-referenced report.

I have attached for your information the comments of Carmen Bianco, Acting President, NYC Transit, and Darryl C. Irick, Senior Vice President, NYC Transit and President MTA Bus, which address this report.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "T. F. Prendergast".

Thomas F. Prendergast  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer

Attachment

*The agencies of the MTA*

MTA New York City Transit  
MTA Long Island Rail Road

MTA Metro-North Railroad  
MTA Bridges and Tunnels

MTA Capital Construction  
MTA Bus Company

# Memorandum



## Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

Date August 29, 2013

To Thomas F. Prendergast, Chairman and Chief Executive Officer, MTA

From Carmen Bianco, Acting President, NYC Transit  
Darryl C. Irick, Senior Vice President, NYC Transit  
President, MTA Bus

Re NYS Comptroller's Report #2013-F-8 Selected Aspects of Bus Fleet Maintenance

We have reviewed the NYS Comptroller follow-up audit report entitled Selected Aspects of Bus Maintenance and were very pleased that the report recognized the significant progress made concerning bus maintenance. As indicated in the follow-up report, four of the seven recommendations were implemented and three were deemed partially implemented. However, we believe that two of the three recommendations (#2 and #3) were fully implemented, as detailed in our comments below:

**Recommendation 2:** "Review the maintenance computer system to ensure that the maintenance scheduled for transferred buses are accurate, and require the Chief Maintenance Officer and local depot management to monitor the initial cycle of maintenance scheduling of such buses."

**Response:** We agree. In July 2013, Maintenance Directive 6-20-11 entitled, "Service Requirements, Buses Permanently Assigned, and Permanent Bus Moves/New Buses in Spear" (attached) was issued. This Directive was provided to the audit team, and requires the Spear Team to create work orders for all transferred or new buses to ensure buses are properly cycled into the inspection program, and to perform quality control reviews to ensure the buses are in the appropriate inspection cycle. The depot Maintenance General Superintendent is responsible to further ensure transferred or new buses are properly received and entered into Spear. Lastly, the Shifters Log Report is now available in Spear which provides the correct inspection intervals for buses. Accordingly, we believe this recommendation was implemented.

**Recommendation 3:** "Inspect and monitor the buses at the LaGuardia Depot which did not receive the required inspections, and determine whether they should be overhauled or have major components replaced."

**NYS Comptroller Report 2013-F-8 Selected Aspects Maintenance**  
**August 29, 2013**  
**Page 2**

**Response:** We agree. We acknowledge that a portion of the hardcopy paperwork to support buses inspected was not available. However, the audit team was provided with electronic Spear records which validated that the inspections were performed. Accordingly, we believe this recommendation was implemented.

**Recommendation 6:** "Determine why the MTA's bus maintenance cost per mile is so much higher than the cost at other transportation agencies. Identify best practices at the other transportation agencies that could be used by the MTA, and develop a plan to reduce the MTA's bus maintenance cost per mile."

**Response:** We agree. The audit report stated, "MTA officials indicate they have engaged in teleconferences and meetings with other transportation agencies to discuss maintenance practices and procedures." As previously discussed with the audit team, we are exploring the development of a Reliability Based Maintenance Program, which emphasizes the capturing, analysis, and reduction of costs.

As noted in the report, the MTA made significant progress correcting problems identified in the earlier report. However, the report did not acknowledge the overall improvements in MDBF, which by the nature of the indicator, achieves reduced maintenance costs and improves in the quality of service provided to our customers.

cc: R. Picarelli

Attachment



# Metropolitan Transportation Authority

NYCT Department of Buses  
MTA Bus Company

## Maintenance Directive



Date: July 9, 2013

To: All General Managers  
All Deputy General Managers  
All Assistant General Managers  
All General Superintendents, Maintenance  
All Concerned

MD #	60-20-11
Rev.	2
Job #:	N/A

From: Henry Sullivan, Chief Maintenance Officer, NYCT DOB, MTA Bus/

Subject: Service Requirements, Buses Permanently Assigned, Permanent Bus Moves/New Buses, and Contingency Fleet in Spear

REVISION INDEX				
Date Revised	Rev. No.	Description Of Revision	Pages Affected	Approved
3-25-13	1	Added the handling and responsibility of reporting the peak bus service requirements on the depot control log. Added the handling and responsibility of Spear rights for all bus moves and transfers	1	
7-3-13	2	Added how the Contingency Fleet will be assigned Added the handling of S.O. inspection cycles and patterns for the Contingency Fleet and who is responsible for maintenance	1 2	

Effective immediately, with each pick, the CMO's office will provide the Spear Implementation Team with the peak bus service requirements for each depot. The Spear Implementation Team will make the adjustments to the Depot Control Log based on the pick implementation dates for the depot. The number of permanent buses assigned to each depot will be reflected on the Depot Control Log as determined by the peak bus requirements and spare factor. The contingency fleet is permanently assigned to the MTACF and loaned / borrowed to their designated facility as determined by the Chief Maintenance Officer and Vice President, Bus Operations.

Depot personnel will be given the rights to move buses permanently in Spear during a *window of ten (10) days prior to and including* the depots pick implementation date. The Depot personnel are responsible for completing these permanent bus moves within this time frame. Outside of this window, only the CMO-Fleet Assignment Manager or designee will

MD 60-20-11 Rev 2 Service Requirements, Buses Permanently Assigned, Permanent Bus Moves, New Buses, and Contingency Fleet In Spear 7-9-2013.doc AA-97

Have the rights to permanently move buses in Spear and all Division / Depot requests to move a bus permanently must be made in writing.

Furthermore, The CMO-Fleet Assignment Manager or designee will notify the Spear Implementation Team of all bus transfers, and the CMO-New Bus Group will notify the Spear Implementation Team of all new bus assignments to ensure the proper handling of S.O. inspection cycles and patterns. The S.O. pattern for the Contingency Fleet will be determined by the assigned designated facility. The designated (loaned / borrowed) facility is responsible for all scheduled and unscheduled maintenance.

The Spear Implementation Team must create all required S.O. work orders for any bus being transferred or new bus acquired. Additionally, the Spear Implementation Team will have a quality assurance process in place to verify that the bus is on the correct inspection cycle.

It is the responsibility of the General Superintendent of Maintenance to confirm that the transfer or receipt of a new bus is properly completed; this includes the verification that any required S.O. Inspection Work Orders are created with the correct mileage cycle. The S.O. Due Date Report should be reviewed to verify that the bus' work order was created with the due date. The Depot Control Log will indicate if any buses are missing S.O. work orders.

Division and Depot personnel will continue to have the rights to move buses as loaned/borrowed, move buses within a sub-facility, and make shop/vendor moves.